

Annual Report for Assessment of Outcomes 2011-2012

Early Education & Family Studies (EEFS)

[CTE Program]

Please address the questions below
send to learningassessment@pcc.edu by **June 22, 2012**; with Annual Report in the subject line

Note: Information provided in this report may be inserted into or summarized in Section 2C (LDC/DE) or 6B (CTE) of the Program Review Outline.

1. Assessment-Driven Improvements Based on Last Year's Assessment

Based on the findings from the 2010-2011 Assessment Outcomes Report, the program has taken a focused effort to integrate developmental information and milestones throughout the curriculum. The program has adopted the text series *The Creative Curriculum System for Infants, Toddlers, and Preschoolers* as a required practicum resource, serving as a foundation for understanding the connection between child development, theoretical principles, and curricular design. Additional texts include the required use *Developmental Profiles: Pre-birth Through Twelve* in ECE 121 (Observation and Guidance I) and ECE 130 (Practicum Seminar). Based on both NAEYC Accreditation Commission recommendations, institutional requirements, and proposals from the EEFS Advisory Committee, the program has restructured the practicum sequence from three levels of practicum to five, with the aim of providing more support for beginning, intermediate, and advanced level students through the use of appropriate skill-based standards. The program continues to support student understanding of child development constructs, including acquisition of “fluency” in identifying specific unique, universal, and contextual developmental concepts.

2. Design

Program Outcome:

Students exiting the program with an AAS in Early Education and Family Studies will apply a recognition of the importance and complex characteristics of children’s families and communities to the creation of respectful reciprocal relationships that support and empower families and involve families in their children’s development and learning. PCC Outcomes: Cultural Awareness, Self Reflection, Community and Environmental Responsibility.

Assessment Description:

Guided by a Checklist for Creating and Assessing Anti-Bias Environments scale (Wolpert, 2005), students conducted a comprehensive analysis of an early childhood program (either their own, or that of a community partner). Students critically assessed the environment and program for cultural relevancy and anti-bias issues in 13 specific content areas. In addition to applying observation skills from previous coursework (ECE 121), this task required students to seek detailed information from colleagues, teachers, aides, supervisors, and regional managers, where applicable. Students were required to “peel back the

wallpaper” of their organization, program, and classroom to discover what was effective or needed attention in relationship to creating a culturally responsive anti-bias early education environment.

The assignments were assessed by instructing faculty with a rubric. The rubric and assignment, were both approved in 2011 by the NAEYC Associate Degree Program Accreditation Commission (the accrediting body for the EEFS AAS degree) as meeting national criteria for the specific accreditation standard presently under assessment. The rubric indicated the extent to which the assignment thoroughly assessed the formative and summative process of evaluating an early education program for culturally relevant anti-bias concepts, attributes, and deficits. The rubric further indicated student engagement with staff and program directors by summarizing the experience, linking conclusions with course content, directly discussing the outcomes of the classroom evaluation with program administration and teachers, and communicating the report in a clear, organized, and professionally written manner. As this is one of several “capstone courses” for the AAS in Early Education & Family Studies offered once per year at the end of their academic program, rubric data was available for a sample of 22 students from one course section of ECE 224 (Multicultural Practices and Curriculum) in Spring 2012.

3. Results

Assessment Results:

The mean score for this assignment was 58.2 indicating that, generally, students Adequately Demonstrated or Achieved the standards. Rubric components were then examined for patterns of performance. For course content items, a minority of students scored as Minimally (n = 2) or Adequately (n=2) meeting the standards, while a majority of the population (82%) Achieved (n = 18) the standards. As noted above, the assignment components require students to assess an environment on a 13 point anti-bias checklist, analyze 9 specific areas for strengths and weakness, provide recommendations, summarize the process and connect the experience to course content, and identify outcomes based on a one-on-one meeting with the administration and staff of the program.

Having calibrated the rubric based on recommendations from the NAEYC Commission, the materials and assignment appear to be effective in structuring, supporting, and achieving the intended student learning outcomes. However, for those scores of Minimal Standard Achievement, it appears students may need additional support in (1) making time to schedule and hold a conference with the program administration, (2) reviewing the assignment to ensure that all instruction points are met, and (3) identifying how the assessment process and outcomes connect to course content. It is unclear whether this minimal achievement is based on insufficient explanation of expectations of assessment instructions, a disconnect between faculty identified requirements as indicated in the instructions, or time management issues for students.

4. Changes to Teaching/Learning

Assessment Changes:

In the next assessment cycle (Spring, 2013), the same rubric and assignment will be employed. However, based on the results that some students appear to struggle with clearly understanding the assessment instructions, time management, and connecting course content, the program and faculty will further emphasize these elements and concepts in the instructional setting, and clarify the assignment accordingly. As students gain clarity about the expectations of the assignment, their ability to further build family and community relationships will be strengthened, thus supporting attainment of the College Outcomes of Cultural Awareness, Self Reflection, and Community and Environmental Responsibility.

5. Changes to Assessment Strategies

As noted above, the same rubric and assignment will be employed in the next assessment cycle (2012-2013). Since the present assessment is engaged only once per year, at the end of the academic year (Week 8), inter-rater reliability with this particular assessment has yet to be established. Thus, the EEFS program will establish reliability and will report the results under the “changes implemented” section of the Annual Report for Assessment Outcomes 2012-2013. Finally, the program continues to develop an appropriate technical skills assessment and rubric for the Advanced Practicum Portfolio process, but is not ready to report data.

Classroom Assessment (60 points)

Rationale: The purpose of this assignment is for learners to critically assess their own early education program and classroom environment for culturally relevant anti-bias concepts, attributes, and deficits. This assignment also provides students the opportunity to reflect on what currently “works” as well as what still needs attention.

Objectives: In completing this assignment, students will be working toward the integration of the following **NAEYC Initial Standards for Professional Preparation Programs and Supportive Skills:**

Standard 2. Building Family and Community Relationships

Key Element 2a. *Knowing about and understanding family and community characteristics.*

Key Element 2b. *Supporting and empowering families and communities through respectful, reciprocal relationships.*

Key Element 2c. *Involving families and communities in their children’s development and learning.*

Supportive Skill 1: *Skills in Self-Assessment and Self-Advocacy.*

Supportive Skill 3: *Written and Verbal Communication Skills.*

Supportive Skill 5: *Skills in Identifying and Using Professional Resources.*

Directions: Your assignment is to conduct a comprehensive analysis of your classroom and early education program, and provide at minimum one recommendation and action plan for nine (9) sections of the assessment tool. If you are currently not working in an early education classroom, please access a willing participant organization in your own community, or contact the PCC Sylvania Child Development Center Laboratory School (971) 722-4569, or the PCC Rock Creek Child Care Center at (971) 722-7511 to inquire about assessing one of their environments. You must make arrangements to do this (don’t assume you may automatically assess their environment). The lab schools reserve the right to not participate due to scheduling demands.

1. Using the *Appendix B: Checklist for Creating and Assessing Anti-Bias Environments*¹ scale, please critically assess your environment and program for cultural relevancy and anti-bias issues in all 13 areas. This may require you to seek detailed information from colleagues, lead teachers, assistant teachers, supervisors, regional managers, etc. In essence, you must “peel back the wallpaper” of your organization, program, and classroom to discover what is working, and what needs attention. Be honest with yourself and others during this process. *Address bias when you see it, and acknowledge inclusive practices.* Use the following key to notate your assessment tool:

¹ Wolpert, E. (2005). *Start seeing diversity: The basic guide to an anti-bias classroom.* Minneapolis, MN: Redleaf Press.

WW = we do this well (all the time) [responsive]
WT = we do this sometimes (more often than not) [we know what we don't know]
WK = we kind of do this (inconsistent) [we don't know what we don't know]
WN = we never do this (none of the time) [unresponsive]

2. Once the assessment is complete, please analyze your assessment tool for areas of challenge, deficit, and success. Select one concept in any 9 areas that you wish to address.

3. Once you have chosen the areas you wish to address, please document the following (no longer than one typed double-space page for each area):

- Identify and describe the deficit or area of challenge (one 3-5 sentence paragraph),
- Describe what is currently being done (or not done) in the environment to support this area (one 3-5 sentence paragraph), and
- Identify the concrete and tangible steps you will take to change, alter, and work towards bridging this gap in your program and environment (one 3-5 sentence paragraph), or improve upon it. Remember, your recommendations must be reflective, "do-able," and real (i.e., be realistic about what can be accomplished).

4. In a separate section (**Heading: Summary and Conclusions**), summarize the process in a final analysis that describes your experience in conducting the culturally relevant anti-bias assessment in your program (i.e., challenges, successes, resistance, confusions, etc.). Discuss how the process conducting the classroom assessment supports building family and community relationships, and involves families and communities in their children's development and learning. Provide any concluding thoughts about the process, and choose one quote from our in-class lectures, textbooks, or videos that "captures" your current thoughts on culturally relevant anti-bias curriculum (discuss why this quote stood out to you).

5. Once you have developed your final assessment, please schedule a conference with the administrator/director and teacher of the environment to review the results of your anti-bias assessment. Discuss your findings and strategies for improvement, and provide a copy of the assessment to the administrator. In a separate section of the paper (**Heading: Outcomes**), please discuss the outcome of this meeting with the administrator and teacher, including the administrator and teachers' respective responses to the assessment, action plans, and any further considerations. Please provide both the administrator and teacher's name, phone number, and email addresses.

5. Depending on the length of your focus areas, your overall paper may be between 16-20 pages. Your summary and conclusions should be between 2-3 pages and your outcomes 2-3 pages, double-spaced, typed, and in a clearly legible font (Times New Roman, Arial, Book Antiqua, etc.). Please attach the "raw data" to your paper.
6. Please use proper APA format, including proper sentence structure, headings, grammar, mechanics, and punctuation.
7. Develop a cover-page for your assessment that states (1) your name, (2) the assignment title [including the location of your assessment site], (3) the course title, and (4) the due date of the assignment. Your assessment should be submitted in a report folio with the grading rubric attached.
8. Be prepared to present your assessment to a small group on the due date.

Assessment Rubric: Anti-Bias Classroom Assessment				
Performance Indicator/Core Competency	Does not demonstrate standard; no evidence of competency achievement	Minimally demonstrates standard; little evidence of competency achievement	Adequately demonstrates standard; foundational understanding; inconsistent	Standard achieved; full understanding; consistent; high level of competency
Standard 2: Building Family & Community Relationships	0 points	6 points	9 points	12 points
Key Element 2a. Know about and understanding family and community characteristics				
Supportive Skill 5: Skills in identifying and using professional resources.				
Documents and assesses environment in all 13 areas using the provided anti-bias assessment tool. (Step 1).	No evidence of documentation or assessment; 0-5 areas addressed; raw data is not attached.	Minimal evidence of documentation or assessment; 0-8 areas addressed; raw data is not attached.	Adequate evidence of documentation and assessment; 6-12 areas addressed; raw data is attached.	Full evidence of documentation and assessment using the provided assessment tool; All 13 areas addressed; raw data is attached.
Key Element 2b. Supporting and empowering families and communities through respectful, reciprocal relationships.				
Each of the 9 areas are clearly identified, one concept selected, analyzed, and recommendations (including action steps) are provided (Steps 2 and 3).	Areas not clearly identified or analyzed, and recommendations are not clear or tangible; 0-3 foci addressed.	Areas not clearly identified or analyzed, and recommendations are not clear or tangible; 4-6 foci addressed.	Areas are moderately identified and analyzed; recommendations are marginally clear; 7-8 foci addressed.	Areas are clearly identified and analyzed; recommendations are clear, tangible, and do-able; 9 foci addressed.
Key Element 2c. Involving families and communities in their children's development and learning.				
Supportive Skill 1: Skills in self-assessment and self-advocacy.				
Supportive Skill 5: Skills in identifying and using professional resources.				
Summary/Conclusion: Summarizes the process and describes experience; provides concluding thoughts; chooses one quote that "captures" current thoughts (2-3 pages) (Step 4).	Does not summarize or describe experience, provide concluding thoughts, or provide a quote.	Minimally summarizes or describes experience, provides minimal concluding thoughts; does not provide quote and justification.	Moderately summarizes experience; provides quote and justification; Summary is weak and feels "rushed."	Full evidence of summary, description of experience and concluding thoughts; quote clearly connects with the paper's overall "thoughts."
Key Element 2b. Supporting and empowering families and communities through respectful, reciprocal relationships.				
Outcomes: Schedules conference with administrator and teacher; discusses results of assessment and documents conference (2-3 pages) (Step 5).	Does not hold conference; does not discuss results of assessment.	Does not hold conference; does not discuss results of assessment.	Holds conference; discusses results of assessment and documents outcomes.	Holds conference; discusses results of assessment and documents outcomes, action plans, etc.
Supportive Skill 3: Written and verbal communication skills.				
Communicates effectively, both written and orally.	Does not follow assignment directions; spelling, grammar, sentence structure is unclear; APA formatting not followed.	Does not follow assignment directions; spelling, grammar, sentence structure is unclear; inconsistent APA formatting.	Some evidence of following assignment directions; spelling, grammar, and sentence structure is moderately clear; APA formatting in compliance.	Full evidence of following assignment directions; spelling, grammar, and sentence structure is clear and appropriate; APA formatting in compliance.

Assignment Notes:

Early Education & Family Studies Assessment Plan 2010-2014

Program Outcome	College Outcome	Assessment	Year
Use their understanding of young children's characteristics and needs, and of the multiple interacting influences on children's development and learning, to create environments that are healthy, respectful, supportive, and challenging for all children.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Critical Thinking & Problem Solving • Professional Competence 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child Development Integrative Observations (2 completed each term). Rubric Evaluated. • Advanced Practicum Portfolio. Rubric Evaluated. 	2010-2011
Apply a recognition of the importance and complex characteristics of children's families and communities to the creation of respectful reciprocal relationships that support and empower families and involve all families in their children's development and learning.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural Awareness • Self Reflection • Community & Environmental Responsibility 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Anti-Bias Classroom Assessment. Rubric Evaluated. • Advanced Portfolio. Rubric Evaluated. 	2011-2012
Use systematic observation, documentation, and other effective assessment strategies in a responsible way, in partnership with families and other professionals, to positively influence children's development and learning.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Professional Competence • Communication • Critical Thinking & Problem Solving 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early Childhood Observation Project. Rubric Evaluated. • Advanced Portfolio. Rubric Evaluated. 	2012-2013
Employ their understanding of and relationships with children and families and their understanding of developmentally and culturally effective approaches to teaching and learning to implement and evaluate experiences that promote positive development and learning for all young children.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Critical Thinking & Problem Solving. • Communication • Cultural Awareness 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Project Approach Assignment. Rubric Evaluated. • Advanced Portfolio. Rubric Evaluated. 	2013-2014

Appendix B

Checklist for Creating and Assessing Anti-Bias Environments

This checklist is an attempt to give practitioners a relatively simplified source to refer to in the ongoing process of implementing an anti-bias approach and reevaluating what works and what still needs attention.

The list is in many ways a work in progress. Feel free to add to it and to make adjustments necessary for cultural relevancy.

1. Staff learn about similarities and differences.

- Staff make a commitment to and develop a plan for learning about cultural and individual similarities and differences related to the following:
 - Values, such as independence versus interdependence
 - Child-rearing practices
 - Communication and learning styles
 - Expression and resolution of conflict
- Staff practice negotiating diverse styles of communication and conflict.

2. Staff learn about bias.

- Staff make a commitment to and develop a plan for learning about their own biases.
 - Read or view and discuss books, articles, and videos about racism, classism, and other biases.
 - Attend relevant training, courses, and workshops.
 - Discuss bias, its sources, and its impact on those to whom it is directed as well as those who carry it.
 - Review and analyze racism, sexism, and other biases in popular media for adults.
 - Analyze bias in language.
 - Collect and discuss scenarios reflecting bias.
 - Practice responding to bias.

3. *Staff make a commitment to intervene when bias is expressed.*

- Staff make a commitment to intervention that models questioning and investigation:
 - Indicate refusal to collaborate with bias.
 - Learn more about a person's experience and reasons for the expression of bias.
 - Encourage critical thinking.
 - Staff make a commitment to counteract expressions of bias.
 - Avoid generalizations that are stereotypes.
 - Abstain from jokes and put-downs related to bias.
 - Use nonbiased language.
 - Provide information.
 - Protest and organize in various ways.
4. Staff develop implementation strategies for the classroom.
- Staff strategize ways to implement an anti-bias approach.
 - Review and analyze school materials and policies for diversity and bias.
 - Record and discuss other issues related to bias in the workplace.
 - Observe, record, and discuss what children are saying and doing in the program related to diversity and bias.
 - Learn about and discuss what diversity and bias children are being exposed to outside the program through popular media and other sources.
 - Practice responding to bias expressed by children.
5. Staff strategize ways to implement an anti-bias approach.
- Staff involve family members.
 - Hold meetings of families and staff to explore issues of bias and related curriculum strategies.
 - Encourage family members to share information about bias they experience and to tell their stories of confronting it.
 - Invite family members to critique activities, books, and materials for bias relevant to their own experiences with bias.

— Ask family members to be a resource for photographs, music, translations, classroom visitors, or field trips to work sites.

6. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: the classroom.

- Staff assess the learning environment.
 - Recognize and support diverse learning styles in the development of daily plans and activities, while encouraging children to try new ways of interacting with people and materials. Example: Some children come from families where emphasis is put on interdependence. They prefer working with a companion or trusted adult to get started with something new or difficult. Others come from families where the emphasis is more on independence and so are more likely to try things on their own.
- Staff learn what stereotypes and biased attitudes children already hold.
 - Observe, listen, and record children's comments and interactions reflecting bias.
 - Using a variety of photographs, have children talk about the people in them and group the people they think can be friends or family.
- Staff encourage children's awareness of diversity and their positive recognition of diverse perspectives.
 - Introduce children to diverse people through field trips, visitors to class, books, photographs in displays, and dramatic play.
 - Find their similarities and their differences, beginning with differences that are least likely to carry value judgments. (Be careful as you move into areas that do carry value judgments. Know that the acknowledgment of those differences, even your attempts to validate them, will probably lead to some teasing and thus intervention. The teasing will lessen as children learn to challenge negative messages regarding differences.)
 - Experiment with doing the same thing in different ways.
 - Compare perspectives on different events, books, or activities.
 - Read books that illustrate diverse perspectives and ways of doing things.

- Point out the variety of methods children use for doing similar things.
- Staff acknowledge bias and teach children to stand up against it.
 - Compare stereotypes to reality.
 - Use books, puppet plays, family and staff stories, or relevant community struggles to model responding to bias.
 - Critique solutions applied in various stories and role-playing, and think about what else could be done to promote cooperative strategies.
 - Have children brainstorm what they would do in situations involving bias.
 - Have children practice responding to bias by acting out short stories or scenarios using puppets or skits.
 - Encourage children to apply the strategies in relevant ways.
 - Intervene when children make remarks reflecting bias.
 - Follow up after interventions related to bias.
 - Regularly reevaluate materials and curriculum for bias related to age, gender, sexual orientation, family composition, class, physical abilities, physical characteristics, race, and ethnicity.

7. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: interactions.

- Staff pay the same attention to, and pick up as quickly on, nonverbal and verbal expressions of interest with:
 - girls as with boys
 - children of color as with white children
 - light-skinned children of color as with dark-skinned children of color
 - children with diverse physical abilities as with able-bodied children
- Staff interpret and respond in the same way to similar behaviors with:
 - boys as with girls
 - children of color as with white children
 - light-skinned children of color as with dark-skinned children of color

able-bodied children as with children with diverse physical abilities

- Staff maintain balance in these ways as well:
 - Girls and boys receive compliments equally on appearance and on achievement.
 - Adapted opportunities are available for children with various physical abilities to interact actively and independently with materials and other children.
 - Caregivers don't overprotect/underprotect children or provide too much/too little help for them because of diverse physical abilities, gender, or race.
 - When children ask or make comments about various physical differences, they receive direct, accurate feedback.
 - When children touch an adult's or child's hair or skin, or make comments about skin color or hair texture, caregivers support and facilitate their explorations instead of ignoring or redirecting them.
 - Caregivers consciously reflect on and reevaluate the messages they send children.
- 8. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: the visual environment.
 - Staff create an environment that reflects students' lives.
 - Make available a camera and money for film and developing costs to take photographs of children, staff, and families in the program for use in displays, games, and books.
 - Staff create a visual environment that supports diversity using books, photographs, and other displays.
 - Use stereotypic images as tools for teaching about bias.
 - Continually reevaluate images in the environment, including the images in computer programs, packaging of materials, food containers, clothing, play figures, puppets, and puzzles.
 - Staff use the following guidelines for choosing visual images:
 - Include lots of photographs of all the children, families, and staff in the program.
 - Reflect the various backgrounds of each child and the people they live with.
 - Reflect people unlike the children in the class.

- Focus on the present rather than the past.
- Seek images depicting cooperation, working together, and people helping each other.
- Seek images depicting struggles for justice and human rights.
- Include groups of people who are often absent from school materials based on racism, ethnocentrism, classism, sexism, homophobia, ableism, ageism, and other forms of the dominant cultural bias.
- Staff avoid repeatedly according low status to certain groups and jobs in classroom materials.
 - Make sure a wide range of people are illustrated both in positions generally considered to be of high status and in positions generally considered to be of low status.

Examples: Females are shown equally as often in roles such as doctor as well as nurse; people of Afro-Caribbean or Asian origin are shown in roles such as bank manager and head teacher as often as they are in roles such as bus driver and food server.

- Staff avoid “tokenizing” people by repeatedly portraying them as follows:
 - Only one of a group
 - Peripheral, nonessential roles
 - Put on the last page
 - Drawn as white people with only a change in skin color, rather than as people with their own individual features
- Staff reflect diverse images of family composition.
 - Single-parent families led by men and women
 - Extended families
 - Families with two mothers or two fathers
 - Families in which one parent and a grandparent are the parents
 - Families in which a grandparent or grandparents are the parents
 - Interracial and multiethnic families
 - Adopted and foster families

- Staff reflect images of families that reflect diversity, including:
 - Class
 - Race
 - Ethnicity
 - Age
 - Physical abilities
 - Physical characteristics such as body size or wearing eyeglasses
- Staff provide images of class diversity that are at least 50 percent reflective of the full range of working-class life in order to:
 - Counter the dominant images of middle- and upper-class life
 - Assist economically advantaged children in developing a more realistic understanding and less superior picture of themselves in the world
- Staff provide images of males and females who share the same range of traits and participate in the same range of activities.
 - Nontraditional jobs inside and outside the home
 - Different types of work, including “blue-collar” jobs (factory workers, repair persons), “pink-collar” jobs (beauticians, salespersons), and “white-collar” jobs (teachers, doctors)
 - Displaying behaviors such as:
 - making decisions
 - leading
 - helping
 - receiving help
 - solving problems
 - being active
 - crying (or sad)
 - observing
 - caring for children

- Staff provide images of people with diverse physical characteristics, such as body size or wearing eyeglasses, that include diversity of:
 - Class
 - People doing different kinds of work
 - Race
 - Ethnicity
 - Age
 - Physical abilities
 - Family composition
 - Recreational activities
- Staff provide images of people who are physically challenged. Include diversity of:
 - Class
 - Employment
 - Race
 - Ethnicity
 - Age
 - Physical ability
 - Family composition
 - Recreational activities
- Staff portray people with physical disabilities as productive members of society with emphasis on what they can do rather than on what they can't do.
 - Important family members
 - Students
 - Teachers
 - Workers
- If the population of the class is predominantly children with diverse physical challenges, staff provide extra images of children and adults with diverse physical challenges doing a broad range of activities.
- Staff provide images of elderly men and women that include the following:

- Involvement in social activities outside the home
- Involvement in nonstereotypical activities
- Independent and active behaviors versus dependent and passive behaviors
- People who are single, widowed, or divorced as well as married
- Equal numbers of men and women
- Diverse races and ethnic groups
- Diverse physical abilities and physical characteristics
- People from various economic backgrounds doing diverse activities
- Connections between the young and old
- Grandparents acting as parents
- Romantic possibilities between people over sixty years old
- Staff provide images of people of color and nondominant ethnic groups.
 - Children and adults from the major racial/ethnic groups in the community and in U.S. society
 - People's current lives rather than their lives in the past or during special holiday celebrations
 - A numerical balance among different groups
- If the population of the class is predominantly children of color, staff is sure that more than half of the images and materials reflect their backgrounds in order to counter the predominance of white cultural images in the general society.
- If the population of the class is predominantly white children, staff is sure that at least half of the images introduce diversity in order to counter the white-centered images of the dominant culture.
- Staff include images of people not living in the United States that make connections between them and Americans.
 - Choose global images based on addressing bias rather than simply to increase diversity
 - People involved in familiar activities such as cooking, eating, playing, working, and recreation

- Staff provide images that depict people in both urban and rural settings. Avoid or challenge stereotypes of rural life as primitive or not as good as urban life by choosing images that depict similarities between urban and rural life.
 - Children playing in similar ways or with similar toys
 - Types of work people do to meet similar needs
 - Children with their families
 - Staff provide images of important individuals.
 - Past and present
 - Diversity of race, ethnicity, gender, physical ability, and class background
 - People who participate(d) in important struggles for social justice
 - Everyday heroes: The important people in our communities and families who struggle in the face of oppression or poverty
 - Provide images of art.
 - A variety of tans, browns, and blacks in materials such as paint, paper, collage materials, playdough, and crayons
 - Artwork (paintings, drawings, or sculpture) and artists of diverse backgrounds creating their art
 - Prints, sculpture, textiles, and other artwork that reflect the aesthetic environments and cultures of:
 - families represented in the classroom
 - diverse groups in the community
 - diverse groups in the United States
9. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: books.
- Staff choose books that:
 - Reflect the backgrounds of the families in the classroom
 - Reflect the diversity of children and families within a group and, to avoid tokenism, provide more than one book about a particular culture, race, or lifestyle
 - Reflect accurate information and images (not stereotypes) depicting diversity of:
 - gender roles
 - racial backgrounds

ethnic backgrounds (emphasizing major groups in your community and in the nation)

physical abilities

occupations, including factory workers, repair people, beauticians, salespersons, teachers, and doctors

ages

family composition

use alphabet and story books in different languages, including Braille and sign language

- Staff emphasize stories that show:
 - Cooperation, working together, and people helping each other
 - Daily contemporary lives—working, being with family, problem solving—with less emphasis on celebrations
 - Struggles for justice and human rights
 - Different ways of living and solving similar problems
 - Groups of people that are often absent from school materials because of racism, ethnocentrism, classism, sexism, homophobia, ableism, ageism, and other forms of dominant culturalism
- Staff choose books that avoid “tokenizing” people by repeatedly portraying them as:
 - Only one of a group
 - Peripheral, nonessential
 - Added on the last page
 - Drawn as white people with only a change in skin color, rather than as people with their own individual features
- Staff avoid repeatedly giving low status to certain groups and jobs in classroom materials. Make sure a wide range of people are illustrated both in positions generally considered to be of high status and in positions generally considered to be of low status. Examples:
 - Show females in roles such as doctor as well as nurse.
 - Show people of Afro-Caribbean or Asian origin in roles such as bank managers and head teachers, as well as bus drivers and school dinner helpers.

- Staff continually reevaluate books they are using.
 - Use books with stereotypic images and inaccurate information as tools for teaching about bias or eliminate them from daily use.
 - Select books and stories about other countries that are relevant to the children in the program and that specifically develop respect and challenge stereotypes and dehumanizing images children receive from their environment.
 - Story lines to be avoided: See the examples of story lines provided in many of the chapters.

10. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: dramatic play.

- For diversity of gender play, staff will ensure:
 - Tools and spaces for working in and out of the house
 - House props that can be other than for the kitchen
 - Props, clothing, and spaces that provide a variety of changing dramatic play arenas, such as a factory, hospital, store, mechanic shop, or bakery
 - Dramatic play props are changed periodically to encourage diverse roles
 - Boys and girls encouraged in all areas, with areas rearranged if necessary to do so
 - Time set aside for just boys or just girls to encourage children to play in areas not chosen based on gender
 - A balance of male and female dolls with a variety of clothes allowing for diversity of gender roles
- Beginning with the variation in their own children's homes, staff show things that reflect ethnic diversity.
 - Various cooking and eating objects
 - Various work tools and clothes
 - Personal objects, such as different kinds of combs and brushes
 - Relevant photographs
 - Doll and people accessories, photograph displays, or other items that represent a balance of the major ethnic groups in the United States

- Staff address diverse physical abilities.
 - Make the tools used by people with diverse physical abilities, such as wheelchairs, crutches, braces, canes, eyeglasses, and hearing aids, available for exploration.
 - Create spaces that are navigable by children using wheelchairs or crutches.
 - Provide a selection of dolls, puppets, and play figures with diverse physical abilities reflecting various racial and ethnic backgrounds, as well as males and females of different ages.
- Staff address racial diversity.
 - Provide doll and people accessories, photograph displays, or other items that represent a balance of the major racial groups in the United States, including African Americans, Latinos and Latinas, Asian Americans, Native Americans, and white Americans.
 - Allow for diverse family configurations.

11. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: language.

- The environment should provide numerous opportunities for children to see and hear various languages, including American Sign Language. Begin with any language that children and their families or staff speak and then expand to those found in the community, city, or nation. Look for language used in labeling materials.
 - Alphabet and number posters
 - Story tapes
 - Songs and records
 - Finger plays
 - Food containers for dramatic play
 - Books that include stories addressing issues of bias related to language

12. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: music.

- Staff ensures that regularly heard music reflects the various cultural styles of the children and staff.
 - Singing
 - Background music

—Music for movement

—Music at naptime

- Staff choose other music to reflect various cultural styles beyond those represented in the classroom with emphasis on that of major groups in the United States.

13. Staff implement an anti-bias approach: manipulatives.

- Staff allow for regularly available manipulative materials—puzzles, play people, lotto games, card games—that depict diversity of race, ethnicity, gender, physical ability, occupation, and class.

Sources

Guidelines for selecting bias-free textbooks and storybooks. 1980. New York: Council on Interracial Books for Children.

Derman-Sparks, Louise, and the A.B.C. Task Force. 1989. *Anti-bias curriculum: Tools for empowering young children.* Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children.

Inner London Education Authority Learning Resources Branch. 1985. *Everyone counts: Looking for bias and insensitivity in primary mathematics materials.* London, England: Inner London Education Authority Learning Resources Branch.

Rigg, Pat, Francis E. Kazemek, and Sarah Hudelson. Spring 1993. Children's books about the elderly. *Rethinking Schools.*

Wolpert, Ellen. 1998. *Strategies for implementing an anti-bias approach in programs for young children.* Unpublished manuscript.